



Finance and Administrative Services Department

PURCHASING DIVISION

115 S. Andrews Avenue, Room 212 • Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33301 • 954-357-6066 • FAX 954-357-8535

Certified Mail No. 7003 1010 0003 0948 1920

May 17, 2019

Laurie Mandell
Vice President of Account Management
United Healthcare
3100 SW 145th Ave, Suite 201
Miramar, FL 33027

Re: Protest – Solicitation No. GEN2116451P2, Group Dental Preferred Provider Organization (DPPO) Insurance

Dear Ms. Mandell:

Broward County Purchasing Division ("Purchasing") is in receipt of United Healthcare's ("United") timely protest letter of the Recommendation of Ranking for Request for Proposal No. GEN2116451P2, Group Dental Preferred Provider Organization Insurance (the "RFP") dated May 1, 2019, which included the required \$3,000 protest filing fee. United's protest contests the five (5) points allocated to Cigna Dental Health, Inc. ("Cigna") for location. More precisely, United's protest alleges that 1) Cigna was not the named entity that submitted a proposal for the RFP, 2) Cigna is not the named entity that would provide scope of services outlined in the RFP, and 3) Cigna's corporate officers as noted in the Florida Department of State Division of Corporations' website (www.Sunbiz.org) are not located at 1571 Sawgrass Corporate Parkway, Suite 140, Sunrise, FL 33323.

The RFP Evaluation Criteria for Location states that a vendor with a principal place of business location (also known as the nerve center) within Broward County will receive five points and that a vendor not having a principal place of business in Broward County will receive zero points. On April 24, 2019, an Evaluation Committee meeting was held for the RFP and five (5) points were allocated for location to Cigna and the Evaluation Committee voted Cigna as the first-ranked firm.

Upon receipt of United's protest, Purchasing reviewed all submitted documentation, including the Florida Department of State Division of Corporations database, to ensure that Broward County allocated the correct number of points to Cigna for location. Purchasing confirmed that Cigna Health and Life Insurance Company is the entity to provide Dental Preferred Provider Organization ("DPPO") coverage on behalf of Cigna for the RFP. Purchasing further confirmed that Cigna Health and Life Insurance Company has a principal business address of "900 Cottage Grove Road Bloomfield, CT 06002" according to Sunbiz.org.

Broward County Board of County Commissioners

Mark D. Bogen • Lamar P. Fisher • Beam Furr • Steve Geller • Dale V.C. Holness • Nan H. Rich • Tim Ryan • Barbara Sharief • Michael Udine
www.broward.org

Laurie Mandell, Vice President of Account Management, United Healthcare
Protest - Solicitation No. GEN2116451P2, Group Dental Preferred Provider Organization (DPPO)
Insurance
May 17, 2019
Page 2 of 2

Based on the above review, and in accordance with the RFP's evaluation criteria for location, Purchasing confirms that United has legal standing to protest the Recommendation of Ranking. The five (5) points for location were incorrectly allocated to Cigna. Therefore, it is my determination to uphold United's protest and rescind the proposed Recommendation of Ranking. Purchasing will reconvene the Final Evaluation Committee Meeting to allow for the re-scoring and re-ranking of the firms.

As the protest is upheld, your protest filing fee in the amount of \$3,000 will be returned under separate cover.

Sincerely,



Brenda J. Billingsley, Director
Purchasing Division

Attachment

BJB/lg/dce/lg

c: David Kahn, Director, Human Resources Department
Glenn Marcos, Assistant Director, Purchasing Division
Luis Gorgoy, Purchasing Manager, Purchasing Division
Christopher Snyder, Purchasing Agent, Purchasing Division
Fernando Amuchastegui, Assistant County Attorney, Office of the County Attorney
Neil Sharma, Assistant County Attorney, Office of the County Attorney



3100 SW 145th Avenue
Suite 201
Miramar, FL 33027

May 1st, 2019

Brenda Billingsley
Director of Purchasing, Broward County Government
115 S. Andrews Avenue
Room 212
Fort Lauderdale, FL 33301

RE: Formal Protest of GEN 2116451P2 – Group Dental DPPO Insurance

Dear Ms. Billingsley:

On behalf of United Healthcare Insurance Company, we wish to file a formal protest regarding GEN 2116451P2 – Group Dental Preferred Provider Organization (DPPO) Insurance rebid.

Our protest is with the award of the 5 points for Location for Cigna Dental Health, Inc. through Broward County's RFP-RFQ-RLI Location Attestation Form (Evaluation Criteria). We protest this award of Location points for Cigna Dental Health, Inc. was not the vendor entity that submitted a proposal for this coverage, they are not the entity that would provide the coverage, and their corporation's officers as documented on the Florida Department of State Division of Corporations (Sunbiz.org) are not located at the 1571 Sawgrass Corporate Parkway, Suite 140, Sunrise, FL 33323.

Vendor Entity Listed on Submittal Documents – On pages 1 through 14 of the supporting documentation which were obtained from the Broward County Government Purchasing Department's webpage with Cigna's submittal, the Vendor who proposed this coverage is Cigna Health and Life Insurance Company (CHLIC) which is located at 900 Cottage Grove Road, Bloomfield, CT 06002, and not Cigna Dental Health, Inc. These documents include the following;

- Cigna's Cover Letter – page 1
- Broward County Government's Evaluation Criteria Response Form – page 2
- Broward County Government's Vendor Questionnaire Form – page 3
- Florida Office of Insurance Regulation certificate – page 4
- State of Florida Department of State certificate – page 5
- Cigna 2018 Annual Report – page 6 & 7
- Broward County Records, Taxes and Treasury Division report – page 8
- Broward County Government's **RFP-RFQ-RLI Location Attestation Form** signed by Scott Evelyn, Vice President of Cigna Health and Life Insurance Company (CHLIC) – pages 9 – 13

Vendor to Provide Listed Coverage – On pages 15 and 17 of the supporting documentation, the Vendor who is going to provide the DPPO dental coverage is Cigna Health and Life Insurance Company with a Home Address of Bloomfield, Connecticut, not Cigna Dental Health, Inc. These documents include the following:

- Cigna’s Sample Policy for the Florida DPPO – page 15
- Cigna’s Certificate of Liability Insurance per Broward County requirements – page 16 & 17

Cigna Dental Health, Inc.’s Corporate Officers are not located in Broward County – per the Broward County Government RFP-RFQ-RLI Location Attestation Form (Evaluation Criteria) (copy provided on pages 18 and 19 of the supporting documents), under the Broward County definition of a principal place of business, point 2 states that “*A principal place of business refers to the place where a corporation’s officers direct, control and coordinate the corporation’s day-to-day activities.*” Then next to the box that needs to be checked to be awarded the 5 points for Location it states “*The Vendor certifies that it has a principal place of business (also known as the nerve center) within Broward County, as documented in Florida Department of State Division of Corporations (Sunbiz), and attests to the following statements: 1. Vendor’s address listed in its submittal is its principal place of business as defined by Broward County;...*”

Based upon calling Cigna Dental Health, Inc. at the (954) 514-6600 phone number listed for them under Sunbiz.org and through a Google/Linkedin search of their corporate officers (Sunbiz.org listing provided on pages 20 through 23 of the supporting documents) we were unable to contact any of them at the 1571 Sawgrass Corporate Parkway, Suite 140, Sunrise, FL 33323 address, rather we found that they had corporate addresses located mainly in Pennsylvania and Connecticut. Many of these officers were also on various other Cigna corporate entities in other states, therefore they could not be directing, controlling or coordinating the day-to-day activities of Cigna Dental Health, Inc. from the Sunrise office attested.

- Sunbiz.org listed of corporate officers for Cigna Dental Health – page 20 - 23
- Various web search results for corporate officers – page 24 – 26

Based on the facts listed above, we formally ask to have the 5 points awarded to Cigna Dental Health, Inc., for GEN 2116451P2 – Group Dental Preferred Provider Organization (DPPO) Insurance rebid, for Location removed from their scoring.

Thank you for your consideration in this matter.

Sincerely,



Laurie Mandell
Vice President of Account Management

Laurie_Mandell@uhc.com