

Transit Transitional Employment (TTE) Pilot Program

- Summary Report -

Summary of Program

On June 23, 2016, the Board of County Commissioners(Board) approved a one-year Transit Transitional Employment (TTE) Pilot Program with Opportunities Industrialization Center of South Florida (OIC-SFL) and ARC Broward (ARC) as the selected vendors to provide supplemental cleaning services on the BCT Fleet of buses at both garages and selected transfer sites. The contracted start date for this service was September 19, 2016.

The TTE Pilot Program provided employment opportunities for Broward County adults that are age eighteen (18) or above residing in targeted areas of low income, high unemployment or persons participating in a state or local re-entry program through a partnership with two non-profit organizations experienced with working with the population. Through these partnerships with OIC-SFL and ARC, the participants received and were introduced to specialized job readiness classes, vocational and job skills training and received future job placement assistance.

Operations

OIC-SFL had a phased start with service beginning on September 19th at the Ravenswood garage and the Downtown Terminal. Service at Copans began on September 26th. Supplemental interior bus cleaning service with ARC started on October 17th at the Lauderhill Mall, and on October 18th at the West Regional Terminal. Supplement service was provided by ARC at Lauderhill Mall and West Regional terminal transfer sites.

The supplemental cleaning has been well received by the public and bus operators. Prior to this pilot program, buses were in service all day without interim cleaning occurring. Employees of both vendors received compliments and accolades for providing mid-day cleaning. In some cases, some operators would not leave the downtown terminal without having their bus cleaned by OIC.

Performance

The following table illustrates the performance results of the program.

Measurement	Contract Target	Actual
Comprehensive in-depth interior cleaning nightly per garage (modified)	12 Buses	15 Buses
Percentage of buses receiving interior cleaning at transfer sites daily	50%	53%
Percentage of buses receiving visual inspection of cleanliness daily	5%	25%
BCT Customer survey results	90%	85%
Hiring employees who meet the Eligibility Criteria	70% Minimum Standard	OIC-SFL – 92%; ARC Broward – 70%

Since the program inception, there has been a considerable decline in customer complaints. Currently, the cleanliness approval rating is at 85% with our customers.

OIC's original output contract goal was 36 buses per shift, per location. This level of output was forecasted with six hours of output of six (6) buses cleaned per hour with six (6) staff per location. Based on the review of the program and requirements, the output number was modified. OIC has five (5) staff persons per shift at Copans and four (4) per shift at Ravenswood with each staff person entitled to a 30-minute lunch break. The lunch break reduces output time to five hours thirty minutes. BCT and OIC has agreed to a minimum output of 12 buses per facility, nightly for this program.

Initially, buses were not staged for the TTE Cleaners and required additional attention to include the removal of stickers, graffiti and gum. This resulted in additional time to complete interior bus cleaning. Additionally, OIC staff spent time walking large distances replenishing supplies and water. During the first few weeks, Ravenswood staff were detailing 11 – 13 buses nightly and Copans staff were detailing 6 – 9 nightly. The initial output numbers were low due to the overall interior condition of each bus and the lack of staging. For the first week at Ravenswood (September 19 – 25), seventy-two (72) buses were detailed; for the first week at Copans (September 26 – October 2), 58 buses were detailed. For the week of November 7 – 12, OIC staff cleaned Two hundred five (205) buses at the garages; 106 at Ravenswood and 99 at Copans. Output continues to increase as OIC has now detailed the entire fleet and staging the buses closer to the service line is now standard practice for BCT. OIC staff are not allowed to operate or move BCT buses.

OIC-SFL launched the program with twenty-six (26) employees; two employees never started and an additional fourteen have resigned or been dismissed for attendance/conduct issues. Currently, OIC-SFL has twenty-four (24) staff persons with a target goal of maintaining 26

employees. OIC has had a few staffing challenges, primarily with the Copans location and the late-night hours are not conducive for employees without reliable transportation.

ARC launched the program with three employees, two cleaners and one on-site supervisor. The positions are all part time. Staffing the on-site supervisor position has been challenging. Due to economies of scale for this project with respect to ARC's overall programming, and the challenges associated with staffing the on-site supervisor position and meeting the programs eligibility requirements, ARC has opted to discontinue providing service, after September 30, 2017. As a result, OIC-SFL has agreed to continue the pilot program with responsibility for the locations previously serviced by ARC. The three cleaners employed by ARC would transition over to become OIC employees.

Pathway to Employment

As part of the program, a Pathway to Employment with Broward County was established. For consideration, participants must have successfully attained their commercial driver's license (CDL) permit and achieved the following criteria – 1) work a minimum of six months of employment, 2) work a minimum of 480 hours with the non-profit under the supplemental cleaning contract, and 3) meet employment performance objectives.

Seven candidates were recommended for employment as a coach service attendant (CSA) with Broward County, and were provided CDL training classes. As of October 31, 2017, two of the recommended employees were given an offer of employment, due to successfully meeting all the established criteria.

Recommendations

Due to the successful results of the program, County staff recommends retroactively reinstating the agreement with OIC-SFL and extending the terms for another two years. As part of the amended contract with OIC-SFL, County staff recommends three program enhancements - 1) Adding an additional day of service at the Sawgrass transfer site; 2) Adding an additional two persons to each shift at the garage; and 3) Adding two additional weekend shifts per garage location. As noted above, ARC Broward has decided not to continue providing services.

Original Garage Levels			Proposed Levels		
Location	Staff Qty.	Days	Staff Qty.	Days	Comments
Copans	5	7	7	7	An additional shift would be added on Sat and Sun for each garage
Ravenswood	4	7	6	7	
Total	9		13		

TTE OUTPUT RESULTS:

Garage Nightly Results

Location	Sept.*	Oct.	Nov.	Dec.	Jan.	Feb.	March	April	May	June	July	Total Buses
Copans	38	276	459	377	460	519	599	602	573	551	611	5,065
Ravenswood	124	329	586	520	460	391	467	443	468	410	395	4,593
Total	162	605	1045	897	920	910	1066	1045	1041	961	1006	9,658

* Partial Month/ Program had phased start dates

Total Buses Cleaned	5,027	4,469	(Excludes Sept.)
# of days	303	303	
Nightly Average	17	15	

Copans Ravenswood

Transfer Site Results

Location	Sept.*	Oct.	Nov.	Dec.	Jan.	Feb.	March	April	May	June	July	Total Buses
NTC	60	150	253	150	237	323	377	357	377	374	297	2,955
Sawgrass	12	125	192	183	242	263	306	341	258	290	327	2,539
Downtown	532	1,062	1,248	1,272	1,719	1,874	2,099	1,956	2,253	2,098	2,092	18,205
Total	604	1,337	1,693	1,605	2,198	2,460	2,782	2,654	2,888	2,762	2,716	23,699

* Partial Month/ Program had phased start dates

Qty.

Cleaned Total Qty. (Excludes Sept.)

23,095	43,960	53%
--------	---------------	-----

Attachments:

Exhibit 1 - Sept 5 Letter from ARC Broward

Exhibit 2 – Status Update from OIC-SFL

Exhibit 3 – Proposed New Pricing from OIC-SFL



September 5, 2017

Kesha Davis
Assistant to the Dept. Director
Broward County Transportation Department
Suite 3100 A
1 N. University Drive, Plantation, Florida 33324

Dear Ms. Davis,

Pursuant to our conversations, we will implement the supplemental bus cleaning services through September 2017. Our agreement for services will end on September 29, 2017.

The contract was most rewarding as it offered employment opportunities for individuals with disabilities and those who have other barriers in finding and maintaining employment. During the pilot year, we provided employment for a total of 8 employees. Three bus cleaners remained employed, and a total of five on-site supervisors were hired. We were able to maintain the 70% eligibility criteria for employees hired under this contract. Our team took great pride in the provision of services.

The most significant challenges faced by Arc Broward pertaining to the scope of services included programmatic inefficiencies related to economies of scale, the continual turnover of the on-site supervisor position, and challenges with recruiting eligible back-up personnel to cover for vacancies.

Arc Broward thanks you and the entire transportation department team, the County staff, and the Broward County Commissioners for the opportunity to participate in this pilot project. Our wish as we conclude this contract term is for the three bus cleaners who have gained valuable experience and have maintained ongoing employment to transition into an employment arrangement with the County or a contracted provider of the County, so they can continue to have meaningful employment and remain contributing members of our community.

Sincerely,

Jody Ellis
Director of Workforce Services

Current eligible staff recommended for BCT Employment:

Darius Fletcher	Reginald Doyle	Reginald Doyle Jr.	Nick Graham
Greg Spence	Elianer Dimache	Lori Cochran	Unique Williams
Maxie Kates	Porscha Kyles	Sandra Gadson	Maxine Price

Internal OIC Promotions (initial bus cleaner promoted to site lead)

Darius Fletcher Maxie Kates Eric Robinson Nick Graham Joy Washington Greg Spence

CDL Training complete

Reginald Doyle Elianer Dimache Sandra Gadson

CDL obtained

Maxie Kates Reginald Doyle Elianer Dimache Joy Washington

Termed Employees/Reason:

Total Termed YTD: 14

Tavery Hamilton /Job Abandonment Tremetria Allen/Attendance

Claudius Hamilton/Job Abandonment Terry/Job Abandonment Latoya Lynn/Resigned

Willie Plummer/Attendance P. Jenkins/ Behavior Kareem Forman/Resigned

Devin Miles/Attendance R. Jenkins/Behavior Gerald Pendergrass/Job Abandonment

Delano Grant/Resigned Sultan Shakir/Job Abandonment Erica Bryant/Resigned

Average Number of Buses Cleaned per shift/Location

Garages: Copans: 22 Ravenswood: 13

Transfer Sites: Downtown: 106 NTC: 40 Sawgrass: 38

Current average buses cleaned per person per shift:

Darius Fletcher/ 2.	Reginald Doyle/1.2	Maxine Price/7.3
Greg Spence/ /1.7	Nick Graham/6.6	Eric Robinson/26.2 Transfer
Maxie Kates/ 5.	Kimberly Atterberry/5.9	Lori Cochran/24.8 Transfer
Joy Washington/6.8	Elianer Dimache/5.2	Adrienne James/23.6 Transfer
Lourdes Mede/5.9	Eric Beuevis/5.4	Earnett Johnson/22.9 Transfer
Dawnett Parker/4.8	Patrick Mohammed/3.4	Israel Brown/24.1 Transfer
Porscha Kyles/5.6	Brittany Smith/5.4	Sandra Gadson/22.4 Transfer
Dewontres Mccray /23.6 Transfer	Reginald Doyle Jr/5.7	Unique Williams 5.7

Current employees inside/outside Distress area: 92%

22 Inside

2 Outside (Greg Spence & Earnett Johnson)

Vendor 1

BUS CLEANING SERVICES FOR BROWARD COUNTY

((2 Garage and 5 Transfer locations))

	Amount	%
Copans Rd - 7 Person Crew	190,052	
Copans Rd - 7 Person Crew - Additional Weekend Shift	54,300	
Ravenswood Crew - 6 Person Crew	163,057	
Ravenswood Crew - 6 Person Crew - Additional Weekend Shift	46,588	
Payroll Tax	34,731	
Direct Labor Subtotal	488,728	80%
UNIT RATE FOR DEPOT LOCATIONS (Direct Labor) - 36,504 total hours	13.39	
Allocated Expenses and Administrative Fee	191,871	
Depot Subtotal	680,599	
UNIT RATE FOR DEPOT LOCATIONS (All Costs) - 36,504 total hours	18.64	
Downtown Remote - 5 Person Crew (5 Days)	59,566	
Lauderhill Remote - 2 Person Crew (3 Days, M, W, F)	14,452	608,765
Northeast Transit Center - 2 Person Crew (2 Days - Tues, Thur)	9,635	
Sawgrass Remote - 2 Person Crew (3 Days - Fri, Sat, Sun)	14,452	
WR - 2 Person Crew (2 Days - Tues, Thur)	9,635	
Shift Supervisor	-	
Payroll Tax	8,242	
Worker's Compensation	4,056	
Direct Labor Subtotal	120,037	20%
UNIT RATE FOR DEPOT LOCATIONS (Direct Labor) - 9,360 total hours	12.82	
Allocated Expenses and Administrative Fee	47,125	
Transfer Location Subtotal	167,162	
UNIT RATE FOR TRANSFER LOCATIONS (All Costs) - 9,360 total hours	17.86	
Allocated Expenses		
Project Manager Salary and benefits	52,800	
Site Supervisor Salary and benefits	36,000	
Site Supplies	33,000	
Payroll, Background Checks, Drug Tests	11,000	
Supplies for Project Manager/Spv	3,000	
Training	6,000	
Project Manager Misc/ Other	3,000	
Total for Allocated Expenses	144,800	
Project Subtotal	753,565	
12.5% Admin Fee	94,196	
TOTAL OF ALLOCATED EXPENSES AND ADMINISTRATIVE FEE	238,996	
Vendor Subtotals	847,761	
PROJECT TOTAL	847,761	

OIC-SFL

Category	Amount	%
Salaries and Fringes	661,565	81%
Other (Supplies, Training, etc.)	56,000	7%
Administrative Fee	94,196	12%
Total	811,761	100%

2017 Value Estimates

Year	Location	Days	Hours	Persons	Weeks	Total Hours	Comments
2017	Ravenswood	7	6	4	52	8736	
2017	Copans	7	6	5	52	10920	
					Baseline	19,656	

Transfer Sites

Year	Location	Days	Hours	Persons	Weeks	Total Hours	Comments
2017	Downtown	5	4	5	52	5200	
	NTC	2	4	2	52	832	
	Sawgrass	2	4	2	52	832	
	YC	2	4	2	52	832	Not Serviced
	Lauderhill	3	4	2	52	1248	Provided by ARC
	WR	2	4	2	52	832	Provided by ARC
					Baseline	9,776	

2018 Value Estimates

Year	Location	Days	Hours	Persons	Weeks	Total Hours	Comments
2018	Ravenswood	7	6	6	52	13104	Increases staff from 4 to 6
2018	Copans	7	6	7	52	15288	Increases staff from 5 to 7
					Adding two more staff	Baseline	28,392

Proposed Operation

Year	Location	Days	Hours	Persons	Weeks	Total Hours	Comments
2018	Ravenswood	7	6	6	52	13104	
2018	Ravenswood	2	6	6	52	3744	Adds an additional shift for Sat and Sun
2018	Copans	7	6	7	52	15288	
2018	Copans	2	6	7	52	4368	Adds an additional shift for Sat and Sun
					Adding two additional shifts per weekend	Baseline	36,504

Transfer Sites

Year	Location	Days	Hours	Persons	Weeks	Total Hours	Comments
2018	Downtown	5	4	5	52	5200	
	NTC	2	4	2	52	832	
	Sawgrass	3	4	2	52	1248	Added Sunday Shift
	Lauderhill	3	4	2	52	1248	
	WR	2	4	2	52	832	
					Baseline	9,360	

Calculations

2018 Proposed Pricing from OIC SFL