A Tale of Two Airports

The contrasting realities of working as a passenger service worker at MIA and at FLL and why low standards hurt the airport and our communities.
A Tale of Two Airports

Low standards at Fort Lauderdale-Hollywood International Airport are undermining the quality of service, safety and security, and are draining public assistance programs by sustaining an airline low-bid contracting system that relies on poverty jobs. Broward County, the airport's owner and operator, has the opportunity to fix these problems and inject millions of dollars into the County's poor and vulnerable communities by following the footsteps of other airport operators, like Miami-Dade County, which have set minimum wage and benefit standards for passenger service workers.

Contents

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY 3
INTRODUCTION 5
   Different Living Wage Ordinances 5
   Report Goals and Methodology 6
SURVEY OF PASSENGER SERVICE WORKERS AT FLL AND MIA 7
   Survey Sample 7
   Main Survey Findings 7
BROWARD COUNTY CAN AND SHOULD FIX THE PROBLEM BY INCREASING STANDARDS AT FLL 11
   Improving Standards at the Airport Has Proven To Be Good Policy 11
   Other Airports around the Country Are Taking Action to Increase Standards 12
   Airlines Are Making Record Profits and Should Invest In Front-Line Employees at FLL 12
   Conclusion 13
   Endnotes 14
In the last few years, airlines have increasingly relied on a business model based on outsourcing parts of their operations to low-bid contractors, replacing what were once middle-class, family-sustaining positions with minimum-wage, poverty jobs. Thus, the increase in outsourcing, as detailed in a 2013 report sponsored by the University of California, Berkeley, Center for Labor Research and Education, has been accompanied by a significant erosion of wages felt mostly by passenger service workers, the employees of airline contractors. The report also states that the decline in standards has not only hurt workers and their communities, but may also negatively affect the safe and efficient operation of airports.

Several airport operators including Miami-Dade County, which owns and operates Miami International Airport (MIA), have taken steps to address the problem by adopting policies that set minimum standards in wages and benefits for passenger service workers. But most airport operators have not taken such measures, leaving passenger service workers at the mercy of the low-bid contracting system, resulting in a race to the bottom at US airports. The latter is the case at Fort Lauderdale-Hollywood International Airport (FLL), owned and operated by Broward County, where passenger service workers are not currently covered by the County’s Living Wage Ordinance.

Survey of passenger service workers at MIA and FLL
To show the effects on passenger service workers of not being covered by a Living Wage standard at FLL, SEIU 32BJ surveyed close to four hundred passenger service workers at FLL and MIA, asking them about themselves, their working conditions and the effects that those have on their daily lives. The surveyed workers were employed by three airline contractors that operate at both MIA and FLL, and included wheelchair attendants, baggage handlers, cabin cleaners, queue management workers, and others.

The survey found that:

- **Most workers at FLL are black, while most workers at MIA are Hispanic.** Even though passenger service workers at FLL and MIA are largely immigrant, the ethnic breakdown of the workforces is very different. At FLL, most passenger service

---

**Theotis Pressley,**
**Wheelchair Attendant at FLL, working for G2 Secure Staff.**

“The low wages that we get make life very tough. You cannot afford to take a vacation, attend family gatherings or see family who are out of town. You can only pay some of the bills, never in full. When I pay a bill, it is usually a past due amount, and by next month, I will already have other past due amounts. You never catch up.”
workers are black and immigrants from Haiti and the Caribbean. At MIA, most passenger service workers are Hispanic, and originating from Cuba.

- **Average wages are much higher at MIA.** Passenger service workers at FLL reported average wages of $7.46 overall, and $8.14 for non-tipped workers. At MIA workers reported average wages of $11.01, and $13.96 for non-tipped workers. The wages at FLL put workers significantly below federal poverty guidelines, which is not the case for workers at MIA.

- **Workers at FLL have shorter lengths of employment than MIA workers.** In a sign that MIA workers enjoy more job stability, they reported an average length of employment of 5.2 years, compared to just 3.5 years for FLL workers.

- **Household incomes of FLL workers are much lower than those of MIA workers, causing more difficulties in their personal lives.** A much higher percentage of FLL workers reported annual household incomes below $10,000 than MIA workers (32 percent vs 21 percent) and below $16,000 (65 percent vs 40 percent). A higher percentage of workers at FLL reported that they have difficulties paying the bills and that they have to rely on public assistance than those at MIA.

A Living Wage for passenger service workers at FLL could create the following benefits:

- Improvements in the quality of service by making workers more efficient and productive.
- A safer airport by reducing worker stress and promoting job stability.
- A boost to economic development by creating an influx of as much as $14 million per year to the communities where workers live in Broward County, which tend to be poor and economically vulnerable, including Lauderhill, Lauderdale Lakes, North Lauderdale and portions of Miramar and Hollywood.

As reported in a publication sponsored by the University of California Berkeley, after a set of minimum labor standards was established at San Francisco International Airport in 2000, employers reported significant decreases in turnover rates, resulting in substantial savings, and improvements in customer service, employee morale, disciplinary issues and absenteeism.

After weathering the effects of the 2009 recession, the airline industry is in very good financial shape, benefiting from low oil prices and strong demand. Airlines in the US, including the top carriers at FLL and MIA, are reporting record profits. Thus, airlines can and should invest in front-line employees, which would not only benefit the carriers, but also the airport and other airport stakeholders.

SEIU 32BJ strongly recommends that Broward County extends coverage of its Living Wage Ordinance to passenger service workers at FLL.

---

**Broward County has an opportunity to fix these problems**

Broward County has the opportunity to join a number of airport owners and operators nationwide that have recently recognized that improving standards at airports is good policy and can bring significant benefits, not just to the airports themselves, but also to airport stakeholders and the surrounding communities.
A November 2013 report sponsored by the University of California, Berkeley, Center for Labor Research and Education found that outsourcing in air transport-related industries has increased substantially in recent years, with its share going from 16 percent in 1991 to 26 percent in 2011. The root cause for that trend is the widespread adoption by airlines of a business model based on outsourcing key parts of their operation to low-bid contractors, replacing positions that were once middle-class, family-sustaining jobs, with minimum-wage, poverty jobs with little stability. The report also detailed how the resulting wage erosion and decline in standards not only hurt the workers and their communities, but may also negatively affect the security and efficiency of airports.

A number of airport operators around the country have taken steps to reverse those trends in an effort to mitigate their negative effects on airport operations and stakeholders. One by one, they have enacted Living Wage or minimum wage and benefit policies that have sought to bring these positions closer to being good jobs. A 2013 study of improvements made for airline contractors employees at San Francisco International Airport found that those policies improved worker performance and decreased turnover rates.

However, most airports have not taken such actions, leaving a large majority of airport workers in the US stuck in poverty jobs created under the current business model of the airline industry, where airlines are making record profits while outsourcing key parts of their operation to low-bid contractors.

Nowhere is that contrast more evident than in South Florida, where passenger service workers, the outsourced employees of airline contractors, face very different realities at the area’s two major commercial service airports, Miami International Airport (MIA), owned and operated by Miami-Dade County, and Fort Lauderdale-Hollywood International Airport (FLL), owned and operated by Broward County. The key difference is that passenger service workers at MIA have benefitted for several years of being covered by the County’s Living Wage Ordinance, which establishes a minimum compensation level that is significantly higher than the state and federal minimum wage rates. On the contrary, passenger service workers at FLL have no minimum wage or benefit standards other than those established by state and federal laws.

Now, Broward County has the opportunity to fix the problem. By ending the passenger service workers’ exclusion from its Living Wage Ordinance, Broward County would take a very important step to safeguard FLL’s tradition of excellence.

Different Living Wage Ordinances
The Miami-Dade Board of County Commissioners unanimously passed a Living Wage Ordinance in 1999, establishing a minimum rate of pay for County employees, and workers employed by County contractors and service contractors at Aviation facilities, including Miami International Airport. The Ordinance also established that the Living Wage rate would be adjusted annually according to inflation without any restrictions every fiscal year. Thus, as of October 1st, 2014, the Miami-Dade Living Wage rate is $12.46 per hour for workers who are also provided a qualifying health benefits plan, and $14.27 for workers who are not.

Broward County also adopted a Living Wage Ordinance in 2002. However, the Broward County Living Wage differs significantly from the Miami-Dade Ordinance. First, even though the Living Wage rate in Broward was originally also indexed to inflation without restrictions, in 2008 the Board of County Commissioners...
voted to amend the Ordinance and cap increases of the Living Wage by the lower of 3 percent or the increase received by the unrepresented County employees\cite{vii}. Pursuant to those indexing guidelines, the Broward County Living Wage rate is currently set at $11.68 for workers who receive qualifying health benefits, and $13.20 for those who do not\cite{viii}.

But more importantly for the approximately 1,200 passenger service workers at FLL, the biggest difference between the Broward County Living Wage and its Miami-Dade counterpart is that it does not apply to them. Covered workers of the Broward Ordinance include employees of the County, County service contractors and airport concessionaires\cite{x}. Thus, in effect, the minimum wage for passenger service workers at FLL is currently set by state law, which is slightly higher than the federal minimum at $8.05, or $5.03 for tipped employees\cite{x}.

**Report Goals and Methodology**

This report seeks to present the stark contrast between the working conditions of passenger service workers at FLL and at MIA, and the effects that those standards have on workers’ personal lives and communities.

In addition, this report also presents the reasons why SEIU 32BJ, along with a large number of other airport operators, believes that applying Living Wage requirements to passenger service workers is good policy and that Broward County should adopt similar measures.

To measure the difference between working conditions at FLL and MIA, SEIU 32BJ conducted a non-scientific survey with hundreds of passenger service workers at MIA and FLL, to collect information about their wages, benefits and working conditions, and the effects that those have on their personal lives. To show that the differences in working conditions are more directly related to regulations and policies in place than to specific employers’ practices, SEIU 32BJ focused its surveys on three employers that operate at both MIA and FLL, including Eulen America, G2 Secure Staff and Direct Airline Services. The surveys were conducted between October and November 2014.
Survey of Passenger Service Workers at FLL and MIA

Survey Sample

As previously stated, SEIU 32BJ’s survey focused on passenger service workers employed by three contractors operating at both FLL and MIA, including Eulen America (a.k.a. American Sales and Management Organization Corp), G2 Secure Staff and Direct Airline Services.

By using the number of security badges issued to each contractor to estimate the number of employees, it can be reliably concluded that these three contractors have significantly large workforces at FLL and MIA. Eulen appears to be the dominant passenger service contractor at MIA, with Direct Airline Services also having a significant presence and G2 Secure Staff smaller numbers. Conversely at FLL, the three contractors appear to have similar and significant sizes. It is worth noting that MIA has a considerably higher number of passenger service workers, which could be explained, at least in part, by MIA’s higher passenger traffic figures.

The surveyed job classifications included wheelchair attendants and dispatchers, baggage handlers and porters, cabin cleaners, checkpoint / queue management employees and others. Those categories include workers providing the main services offered by the three above-mentioned contractors at MIA and FLL.

In total, 386 surveys were conducted, 185 with FLL workers, and 201 with MIA workers.

Surveyed Workers by Job Classification

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Job Classification</th>
<th>FLL</th>
<th>MIA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Baggage</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cabin Cleaner</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Queue/Checkpoint</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Security</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skycap</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wheelchair</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>185</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Main Survey Findings

Worker characteristics

The breakdown of ethnic and national background of passenger service workers at MIA and FLL is significantly different, with FLL having a predominantly Black or African-American workforce, comprised mostly of Haitian and Afro-Caribbean workers, and MIA having a predominantly Hispanic or Latino workforce, comprised mostly of workers of Cuban origin.

At FLL, 74 percent of respondents identified themselves as Black or African-American, while 25 percent identified themselves as Latino or Hispanic. At MIA, the distribution was reversed, with 72 percent of respondents identifying themselves as Latino or Hispanic, and 28 percent identifying themselves as Black or African-American.
In addition, both the workforces at FLL and MIA are largely immigrant, with 91 percent of respondents at FLL and 85 percent at MIA having been born outside of the US. Regarding country of birth, 56 percent of respondents at FLL reported theirs as Haiti, with Jamaica the only other foreign country with significant numbers, with 11 percent of respondents. At MIA, on the other hand, 55 percent of respondents reported their country of birth as Cuba, with Haiti as the only other significant foreign country with 14 percent.

Additionally, the survey results showed that, when comparing to respondents at MIA, respondents at FLL were more likely to be women, to have children, and tended to be younger. Respondents at MIA were more likely to be male, with 68 percent of the total, than respondents at FLL, with 52 percent of the total. Additionally, respondents at MIA were older, with the largest group in their fifties, compared to FLL where the largest group was in their forties. Finally, a slightly larger percentage of respondents at FLL reported having children, with 63 percent of the total, while at MIA the percentage was 57 percent.

**Low wages, few benefits**

Workers at FLL reported considerably lower wages than those at MIA. At FLL, the average wage for respondents was $7.46 an hour, while at MIA the average wage for respondents was $11.01.

At FLL, the median wage for respondents was $7.93, the state’s minimum wage at the time of the survey, which was also tied for the most frequent value. At MIA, the median wage for respondents was $14.01, the minimum wage set by the Living Wage Ordinance when no health benefits are provided, which was also the most frequent value.

Tipped workers can be paid lower wages than non-tipped workers, according to federal and state law, provided that the tips actually received by employees make up the difference between the minimum wage for non-tipped employees and the lower minimum wage for tipped employees. In addition, the Miami-Dade Living Wage Ordinance includes certain exemptions that apply to some tipped positions™. Thus, Respondents at FLL who reported that they received tips had average wages of $6.96 per hour, while those who receive tips at MIA had average wages of $8.09. On the other hand, non-tipped respondents at FLL had average wages of $8.14, while their counterparts at MIA averaged $13.96 in wages.

The average wage results at FLL are particularly disturbing given that, assuming a 40-hour work week, wages of $7.46 would...
amount to annual earnings of $15,517, significantly below the federal poverty level for a family of four, which was $23,850 in 2014\(^a\). Even the non-tipped average wage of $8.14, or $16,931 per year assuming a 40 work week, would still place workers significantly below those poverty guidelines.

Conversely, the average non-tipped wage at MIA of $13.96 per hour, which would amount to annual earnings of $29,037 if assuming a 40-hour work week, puts workers significantly above the referenced federal poverty level for a family of four.

Regarding health insurance, more FLL workers reported that they had coverage. At FLL, 38 percent of respondents reported that they have no health insurance, while 52 percent of respondents at MIA reported having no health insurance.

### Have Come Into Work Sick

In addition, 38 percent of respondents at FLL reported that receive at least some amount of paid vacation days from their employer, while just 7 percent of respondents at MIA reported receiving paid vacation days. All workers at both airports, except one FLL worker, reported that they do not receive any paid sick days from their employer. It is worth noting here that the Miami-Dade Living Wage Ordinance does not obligate employers to provide paid days off to covered workers.

Low wages and substandard benefits often appear to force workers to come in to work even if they are sick, potentially putting other workers and the flying public at risk. At FLL, 95 percent of respondents stated that they have come in to work even though they were sick, compared to just 68 percent at MIA.

### Annual Earnings Estimates Comparison

In the annual earnings estimates comparison, the average for both FLL and MIA are above the federal poverty level of $23,850 for a family of four. However, the non-tipped average wage for both airports is significantly below the Federal Poverty Level.

At FLL, the average FLL wage is $15,516 and the non-tipped average FLL wage is $16,931. At MIA, the average MIA wage is $22,901 and the non-tipped average MIA wage is $23,850.
Little job stability

While the surveys with passenger service workers at MIA and FLL do not provide enough information to estimate turnover rates, they can provide a measure of job stability by estimating the average length of employment for each worker at the date when surveying was completed, December 1st, 2014. Job stability can provide several benefits, including more experienced workers who are familiar with materials and procedures. Passenger service workers at FLL reported significantly lower tenures with their employers, at an average of 3.5 years, than those at MIA, at 5.2 years, which could be a sign of higher turnover rates and less job stability.

Average Length of Employment (as of December 1st, 2014)

In addition, a significant majority of respondents at both MIA and FLL reported difficulties paying their bills, with the percentage at FLL noticeably higher. At MIA, 60% of respondents reported difficulties, while at FLL, 87% of respondents did.

Have Trouble Paying the Bills

Further, of all workers surveyed, 29% of FLL workers reported relying on some form of government assistance, such as SNAP (formerly known as food stamps) or housing assistance, while just 18% of MIA workers did. In addition, 28% of FLL workers reported that they receive assistance from Medicaid / CHIP so that their children are covered by health insurance, compared to just 23% at MIA.

Difficulties in personal life

Respondents from FLL reported significantly lower household incomes than those at MIA. At FLL, 32% of respondents reported having annual household incomes below $10,000, compared to just 21% at MIA, and 65% reported annual household incomes below $16,000, compared to just 40% at MIA.

Annual Household Incomes

In fact, if assuming that an FLL passenger service worker making the above-referenced average wage for surveyed workers was the sole provider for a family of 4, that household’s income would make it eligible for Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program (formerly food stamps)**, Medicaid*** and Temporary Cash Assistance for Needy Families****, assuming they met other eligibility criteria.
Broward County Can and Should Fix the Problem by Increasing Standards at FLL

Improving Standards at the Airport Has Proven To Be Good Policy

Broward County has the opportunity to join the national movement to improve working standards for passenger service workers, by extending coverage of its Living Wage Ordinance to over 1,200 workers at FLL.

As employers and policy-makers at MIA have learned, higher wage and benefit standards can help passenger service workers provide better service to their customers and can make airports safer by promoting job stability and reducing worker stress. In addition, by being able to offer better wages and benefits, airline contractors can more easily recruit employees and benefit from the stability and lower costs of decreased turnover rates.

In 2003, researchers associated with the Institute of Industrial Relations at the University of California, Berkeley analyzed the impact on employees and employers of the Quality Standards Program (QSP), which was implemented in 2000 and set higher wage, benefit and training standards for workers at San Francisco International Airport. They found that turnover fell by 34 percent among all employers, saving them $6.6 million per year, and by 60 percent among those that experienced wage increases of 10 percent or more. The researchers also found that 45 percent of employers reported improvements in customer service, 47 percent reported improvements in employee morale, 44 percent reported reduced disciplinary issues, and 29 percent reported decreases in absenteeism.

In addition, improving standards for passenger service workers can stimulate economic development in the communities where airport workers live. Passenger service workers at FLL mostly live in areas surrounding the airport that have traditionally been poorer and more vulnerable than the County average, including Lauderdale Lakes, Lauderdale, North Lauderdale, and sections of Miramar and Hollywood. If passenger service workers were paid the Broward County Living Wage, those communities would benefit from additional earnings of as much as $14 million flowing into their economies every year, which would have a positive impact on employment, economic development and the overall health of workers’ neighborhoods.

Paul Kong,
Skycap at FLL, for Direct Airline Services

“I have worked at FLL for almost three years, I currently make $5.03 plus tips, which usually amount to between $40 or $50 a day. It is hard to have a happy family when you cannot pay the bills. You cannot do much of anything, go out or have fun. If I received a Living Wage, my life would change a lot. I would have a better lifestyle, be able to save a little bit, and live comfortably, for a change.”

Similar to MIA, FLL is currently undergoing significant development and expansion, particularly under a $2.3 billion capital improvement plan. JetBlue and Southwest have indicated that they will increase the number of flights and passengers that they will...
serve through the airport in the future, using it as a base for international expansions. Just recently, FLL announced that it had its busiest year on record in 2014. Thus, passenger service workers at FLL will surely increase their numbers from the current estimated total of 1,200, and their role will continue to be central to the airport's operation.

Therefore, improving standards will be crucial in ensuring that FLL continues to be a first-class airport, and that the increased economic activity can benefit Broward County residents, and not just the airlines operating at the airport.

**Other Airports Around the Country Are Taking Action to Increase Standards**
In the last few years, and especially more recently, several other airports in the US have followed MIA’s and other airports’ lead and have adopted policies to improve the wages and benefits of passenger service workers (see the table below). Many efforts to improve standards have been non-contentious as airport operators, regulatory agencies and other airport stakeholders have recognized the benefits that they can provide.

### Airlines Are Making Record Profits and Should Invest In Front-Line Employees at FLL
Airlines have recovered from the effects of the 2009 recession, and are currently reporting record profits. After turbulent periods marked by several mergers and restructurings, airlines have emerged bigger and stronger, and are currently benefiting from lower oil prices and strong demand. The International Air Transport Association recently estimated that global airline profits totaled $19.9 billion in 2014, and forecasted that profits will rise to $25 billion in 2015.

American Airlines, the dominant airline at MIA, recently reported record earnings for the fourth quarter of 2014, completing a year where earnings, excluding special items, totaled an impressive $4.2 billion.

The largest airlines at FLL also enjoyed a very good 2014. Delta, the largest legacy carrier at the airport, reported earnings $2.8 billion. Southwest, the third largest airline at FLL, posted annual earnings of $1.4 billion, breaking its own all-time records.

### Minimum Wages Applicable to Passenger Service Workers Effective as of 2/1/2015

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Airport</th>
<th>Minimum wage, if healthcare provided</th>
<th>Minimum wage, if no healthcare provided</th>
<th>Indexed?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Boston</td>
<td>$10.00</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>No*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Los Angeles</td>
<td>$11.03</td>
<td>$15.84</td>
<td>Yes, CPI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miami</td>
<td>$12.46</td>
<td>$14.27</td>
<td>Yes, CPI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newark</td>
<td>$10.10</td>
<td>N/A**</td>
<td>Yes, CPI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York - JFK</td>
<td>$10.10</td>
<td>N/A**</td>
<td>Yes, CPI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York - LGA</td>
<td>$10.10</td>
<td>N/A**</td>
<td>Yes, CPI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>$12.27</td>
<td>$14.10</td>
<td>Yes, CPI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philadelphia</td>
<td>$12.00</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Yes, CPI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>San Francisco</td>
<td>$13.52</td>
<td>$17.77</td>
<td>Yes, CPI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>San Jose</td>
<td>$14.13</td>
<td>$15.38</td>
<td>Yes, CPI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. Louis</td>
<td>$12.37</td>
<td>$16.18</td>
<td>Yes, Federal Poverty Guidelines</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* However, the minimum wage rate is scheduled to increase to $11.00 on 1/1/16
** A plan for enhanced wages and benefits, including health benefits is currently under development by the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey, applicable at JFK, LGA and EWR.
*** Minimum wage rates are scheduled to increase to $12.56 with healthcare provided and $16.58 without health benefits, effective April 1, 2015.
Low-cost carriers Spirit and JetBlue, the top two airlines at FLL\textsuperscript{b}, reported annual earnings of $237\textsuperscript{b} and $232\textsuperscript{b} million respectively. All of the earnings figures exclude special items.

**Annual Profits, Excluding Special Items, 2014**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Airline</th>
<th>Profits (in billions)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>American</td>
<td>4.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delta</td>
<td>2.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southwest</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

University of California, Berkeley study from 2013 estimated that about 37 percent of the families of airport cleaning and baggage workers nationwide receive safety net benefits such as Medicaid, SNAP (formerly known as food stamps), or Temporary Assistance for Needy Families, compared to just 25 percent of the population as a whole\textsuperscript{c}. That represents an indirect subsidy to the airline industry that is not fair to taxpayers or workers.

Thus, given that airlines are performing so well, they should be able to invest in their front-line employees, which would benefit all airport stakeholders, including themselves.

**Conclusion**

Even though passenger service workers at MIA are still suffering from the low standards created by the low-bid contracting system in the airline industry, the Miami-Dade Living Wage Ordinance has made a significant difference in their jobs and in their lives. It is clear that better standards at FLL would result in more efficient operations, and stronger communities.

SEIU 32BJ recommends that Broward County adopts measures to ensure that passenger service workers are paid a Living Wage.

In addition, officials at both MIA and FLL should pay closer attention to the negative effects caused by the low-bid contracting system in the airline industry, and take proactive steps to ensure that they do not negatively affect airport operations and airport stakeholders.
Endnotes

i Miranda Dietz, Peter Hall, and Ken Jacobs; “Course Correction - Reversing Wage Erosion to Restore Good Jobs at American Airports.”; Sponsored by the University of California, Berkeley, Center for Labor Research and Education and Simon Fraser University; October 2013; page 5.

ii Ibid., page 1.

iii Michael Reich, Peter Hall, and Ken Jacobs; “Living Wages and Economic Performance – the San Francisco Model”; Institute of Industrial Relations, University of California, Berkeley; March 2003; page 10.

iv Miami-Dade Legislative Item, File Number: 021992; September 9, 2002.

v Miami-Dade Legislative Item, File Number: 991160; May 11, 1999.

vi Miami-Dade Code of Ordinances, Sec. 2-8.9. – Living Wage Ordinance for County service Contracts and County employees; Definitions.


viii Broward County Code of Ordinances, Sec. 26-102(c)

ix Living Wage Poster, effective January 1, 2015; Broward County Website.

x Broward County Code of Ordinances, Sec. 26-101(b) & Sec. 26-102(a)(4)

xi “Notice to Employees – Minimum Wage in Florida”, Website of the Florida Department of Economic Opportunity.

xii Badge request, Miami-Dade Aviation Department, February 2015

xiii Badge request, Broward County Aviation Department, January 2013.

xiv Miami-Dade Code of Ordinances, Sec. 2-8.9.(F)(2)(B)

xv 2014 Poverty Guidelines, Office of the Assistant Secretary for Planning and Evaluation. The original living wage levels in Miami-Dade and Broward Counties were calculated using 110% of the Federal Poverty Level for a Family of Four.


xvii Family-Related Medicaid Programs Factsheet; Florida Department of Children and Families; January 2015; page 2.


xix Michael Reich, Peter Hall, and Ken Jacobs; “Living Wages and Economic Performance – the San Francisco Model”; Institute of Industrial Relations, University of California, Berkeley; March 2003; pages 10, 60.

xx Data from 32BJ database or FLL airport workers

xxi Estimate includes the following assumptions: a) that the number of passenger service workers at FLL is 1,200; b) that the average wage of surveyed workers of $7.46 applied to all passenger service workers at FLL; c) that wages would be increased to the Broward County Living Wage without health insurance of $13.20; and d) work weeks of 40 hours for all passenger service workers. Thus, ($13.20 - $7.46) x 40 hrs/wk x 52 weeks x 1,200 workers = $14,327,040.

xxii FLL Airport Improvements and Renovations (FLLAIR); Official Website of Broward County.

xxiii Arlene Satchell; “JetBlue Looks to Double Capacity in 5 Years”; Sun-Sentinel; May 5, 2013.

xxiv Arlene Satchell; “Southwest Airlines Plans Growth at Fort Lauderdale-Hollywood Airport”; Sun Sentinel; October 27, 2014.


xxvii Current and Prior Living Wage Rates for Airport Employees; City of Los Angeles, California.

xxviii Ibid.

xxix Ibid.

xxx Ibid.

xxxi Ibid.

xxxii Ibid.


xxxiv Ibid.

xxxv Ibid.

xxxvi Ibid.

xxxvii Ibid.

xxxviii Ibid.

xxxix Quality Standards Program; San Francisco International Airport; January 1, 2015.

xl Notice to Employees – Health Care Accountability Ordinance; Office of Labor Standards Enforcement, City and County of San Francisco.

xli MCO Historial Rates, Office of Labor Standards Enforcements, City and County of San Francisco.

xlii Notice of Employee Rights Concerning Wage and Labor Standards for Port Contractors; Social Responsibility Division of the Port of Oakland; Revised April 2, 2014.

xliii Ibid.

xliv Oakland Living Wage Ordinance, Ordinance No. 12050 C.M.S.; Section 11(d)(1).

xlv Living Wage Adjustment Bulletin; St. Louis Living Wage Ordinance; March 11, 2014.

xlvi Ibid.

xlvii St. Louis Ordinance 65597; Section 3(B).

xlviii Memorandum from Kim Becker Aguirre, Director of Aviation, to the Honorable Mayor and City Council, City of San Jose; Airport Living Wage Ordinance Rate Increase; February 5, 2014.

xlix Ibid.

l Ibid.

li Executive Order by Michael A. Nutter, Mayor of the City of Philadelphia; Policy Regarding Minimum Wage and Benefits to Be Provided by City Contractors and Subcontractors; Original version signed May, 6, 2014 and amended June 11, 2014.
Minimum Wages Applicable to Passenger Service Workers (page 15)


ii  Current and Prior Living Wage Rates for Airport Employees; City of Los Angeles, California.

iii  Ibid.

iv  Ibid.


vi  Ibid.

vii  Ibid.

viii  Ibid.

ix  Ibid.

x  Rules for Implementation of Minimum Wage Policy for Non-Trade Labor service Contracts – LaGuardia Airport, John F. Kennedy International Airport and Newark Liberty Airport; Page 1.

xi  Ibid.

xii  Ibid.

xiii  Ibid.

xiv  Notice of Employee Rights Concerning Wage and Labor Standards for Port Contractors; Social Responsibility Division of the Port of Oakland; Revised April 2, 2014.

xv  Ibid.

xvi  Oakland Living Wage Ordinance, Ordinance No. 12050 C.M.S.; Section 11(d)(1).

xvii  Executive Order by Michael A. Nutter, Mayor of the City of Philadelphia; Policy Regarding Minimum Wage and Benefits to Be Provided by City Contractors and Subcontractors; Original version signed May, 6, 2014 and amended June 11, 2014

xviii  Ibid.

xix  Ibid.

xx  Notice to Employees – Health Care Accountability Ordinance; Office of Labor Standards Enforcement, City and County of San Francisco.

xxi  MCO Historical Rates, Office of Labor Standards Enforcements, City and County of San Francisco.

xxii  Memorandum from Kim Becker Aguirre, Director of Aviation, to the Honorable Mayor and City Council, City of San Jose; Airport Living Wage Ordinance Rate Increase; February 5, 2014.

xxiii  Ibid.

xxiv  Ibid.

xxv  Living Wage Adjustment Bulletin; St. Louis Living Wage Ordinance; March 11, 2014.

xxvi  Ibid.

xxvii  St. Louis Ordinance 65597; Section 3(B).


xxix  Living Wage Adjustment Bulletin; St. Louis Living Wage Ordinance; March 5, 2015.
For more information, visit: www.seiu32bj.org
or http://povertywagesdontfly.tumblr.com/
or contact Lili Bach, at lbach@seiu32bj.org